

Item 7 Appendix 2 GP 12th Feb 2020 - Comparison of HR Quotes

Criteria	Importance - proportion out of 100%	Supplier (A)		Supplier (B)		Supplier (C)		Supplier (D)		Supplier (E)		Weighting Score 0-10 low-high	Weighting Importance			
		Weighting Score 0-10 low-high	Weighting x importance	Weighting Score 0-10 low-high	Weighting x importance	Weighting Score 0-10 low-high	Weighting x importance	Weighting Score 0-10 low-high	Weighting Importance	Weighting Score 0-10 low-high	Weighting Importance					
History	1	Set up in 2010 as specialist service to schools although they offer and adapt services to other organisations, currently mainly small charities	2	2	Set up in 1990s. largest UK HR consultancy with 40,000 clients. Cater for organisations of different sizes. State they offer a service suitable for organisations of 5 or less.	6	6	Set up in 2014	4	4	Set up 2001	6	6	Set up in 2011	5	5
Size	2	No information available	2	4	Largest HR company in UK (economy of scale)	3	6	12 members of staff	2	4	125 staff with £10.5m turnover	3	6	26 staff	2	4
Type of Contract	5	Piecemeal relationship on specific services only.	5	25	Long term relationship over 5 years	10	50	Long term relationship. Work on fixed rate monthly fee basis. On 1-5 year basis.	10	50	Long term all inclusive	8	40	Piecemeal relationship on specific services only. However, a contract for a monthly retainer may be arranged	6	30
Cost of contract/5 year cost	5	Pay as You Go- £55+VAT per hour (minimum 30 minutes) + £30+VAT for site visits within 25 miles radius. £2.058 + unknown amount each year with annual price rises and the purchase of additional services.	3	4	Complete end to end service with HR. Comprehensive service - £97+VAT per month for 5 year contract. £171 per month if this includes Health and safety	6	30	Elite package would be £100+ VAT per month/£1200 + VAT for one year. A five year contract would be £70.84+ VAT per month/£850+ VAT per year for five years.	7	35	Dependent on the nature, size and employee profile of the organisation	0	0	Dependent on the nature, size and employee profile of the organisation	0	0
Level of support	10	Piecemeal. Covers only HR advisory/consultancy and contract administration	5	50	Strategic partnership majority of services inclusive in monthly fee	10	100	Unlimited but focus on advice and drafting documents rather than face to face support	8	80	Fully comprehensive	9	90	Practice exclusively in the area of HR and Employment Law, advising across issues in employee/employer relationship. Unlike a call centre, clients can speak directly and he is sole point of contact	9	90
Initial HR audit provided	1	No	1	1	Yes, included in monthly fee	5	5	Yes, included in monthly fee	5	5	Yes, included in monthly fee	5	5	Yes	8	8
On line HR management system and APP (Bright HR)	2	No	1	2	This stores all staff and management paperwork such as contracts, sick and annual leave booking system and other records. Appointments can be made through it. Other facilities include clocking in system	5	10	Yes, at a cost of £2+VAT a month for each user.	2	4	Yes, included in monthly fee	5	10	No	0	0
Helpline	3	Advertised as 8am-6pm, Monday to Friday. Urgent out of hours contact is available - leave a message on the answering machine and they will contact you.	5	15	24 hours a day 365 days a week	7	21	Yes, it operates between 8.30am and 5.30pm	3	9	24 hours a day 365 days a week. Included in monthly fee	7	21	Normal office hours although can be contacted out of hours by mobile phone/email	7	21
Policies, procedures and documents	10	There is a stock range of policies written for schools that can be adapted- these cost up to £90+ VAT each or £800 + VAT for full range. October email recommends 6 core policies at a cost of £30-£90 + VAT each plus a further 4 policies. There are a further 25 policies which include Equality, Bullying and Harassment, Recruitment, Complaints, Freedom of Information, Safeguarding etc. A draft handbook (6-7 pages) would entail roughly 3 hours work at £55 + VAT per hour. The policies have been agreed with local (Calderdale) union representatives and are provided in Word format for local adaptation. Purchasers of the Portfolio are enrolled into a subscription service for updates. This is distributed on an	5	50	Included in monthly fee as are employment law updates	10	100	Included in higher rate monthly fee as are employment law updates	10	100	Included in monthly fee	10	100	Can provide this, either standard or bespoke. (updates?)	8	80
Advice on employment law	5	Pay as You Go- £55+VAT per hour (minimum 30 minutes) + £30+VAT for site visits within 25 miles radius	5	25	Included in monthly fee	10	50	Included in fee. Advisors are specialist employment lawyers.	10	50	Included in monthly fee	10	50	Yes	10	50

Item 7 Appendix 2 GP 12th Feb 2020 - Comparison of HR Quotes

	Supplier (A)		Supplier (B)		Supplier (C)		Supplier (D)		Supplier (E)			
Criteria	Importance - proportion out of 100%		Weighting Score 0-10 low-high	Weighting x importance	Weighting Score 0-10 low-high	Weighting x importance	Weighting Score 0-10 low-high	Weighting x importance	Weighting Score 0-10 low-high	Weighting Importance	Weighting Score 0-10 low-high	Weighting Importance
Recruitment support	3	Advice on recruitment and contract administration included. Full bespoke recruitment support is £2,200+VAT or separate charges for piecemeal support	3	9	5	15	3	9	5	15	5	15
Appraisal	3	Advice only included	3	9	6	18	4	12	6	18	6	18
Staff induction, training and development.	3	Occasional seminars provided on HR topics	2	6	4	12	0	0	4	12	0	0
Support with HR processes such as grievance, discipline and mediation	10	Advice included. Can attend site at additional cost	2	20	4	40	3	30	4	40	4	40
Includes insurance to cover legal issues	10	Not included	0	0	10	100	0	0	10	100	0	0
Tribunals	10	Advice only included	3	30	10	100	3	30	10	100	8	80
Provision of payroll services	5	Not included but can be offered at extra cost through 3rd party organisation	0	0	5	25	0	0	0	0	0	0
Health and safety policies, audit, support and guidance	0	Not included	0	0	2	0	2	0	2	0	0	0
Employee Assistance Programme	1	Not included but can be offered at extra cost on a PAYG arrangement through 3rd party organisation	0	0	4	4	0	0	4	4	0	0
Disclosure and Barring Service - safeguarding	1	Not included but can be offered at extra cost on a PAYG arrangement through 3rd party organisation	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Testimonials	5	No record	0	0	5	25	5	25	5	25	4	20
Level of financial risk to budget from unexpected issues	5	Potentially high	0	0	10	50	5	25	10	50		
	100		47	4700	137	13700	86	8600	123	12300	82	8200